

Navajo County Community College District Governing Board Meeting Minutes

March 21, 2023 – 10:00 a.m.
Painted Desert Campus, Tiponi Community Center
2251 East Navajo Boulevard, Holbrook, Arizona

Governing Board Member Present: Ms. Kristine Laughter; Mr. Frank Lucero; Mr. Everett Robinson; Mr. Derrick Leslie (joined the meeting at 10:09 a.m.).

Governing Board Member Absent: Mr. Elias Jouen.

Others Present: President Chato Hazelbaker; Vice President for Learning and Student Services (VPLSS) Michael Solomonson; Vice President for Administrative Services (VPAS) Maderia Ellison; Associate Vice President – Human Resources (AVPHR) Shenethia Manuel; Director of Institutional Effectiveness Judy Yip-Reyes; Recording Secretary to the Board Paul Hempsey; Norvita Charleston; Betsy Wilson; David Huish; Inez Schaechterle; Elinor Henderson; Rich Harris; Jodie Humphrey; Amy Henderson; Xander Henderson; Muriel Metcalf; Katie Matott; Raeann Brittain; Ryan Jones; Tamora Osborne; Tabitha Stickel; Talaina Kor; Rebecca Hunt; Chris Green; Frank Orona; Gary Santillanes; Jeremy Raisor; Justin White; Olivia Jaquez; Michael Broyles; Rebeccah Sweet; Scott Flake; Josh Rogers; Lia Keenan; Russel Kupfer; Robert Johnson; Melody Niesen; Mark Camisa; Jeanette Hancock; Wei Ma; Daphne Brimhall; Josh Jeffrey; Michael Jacob; Allison Landy; Matt Weber.

Agenda Item 1: Call to Order and Pledge of Allegiance

Chair Laughter called the meeting to order at 10:00 a.m. and asked Board Member Robinson to lead the Pledge of Allegiance.

Agenda Item 2: Adoption of Agenda

Mr. Lucero made a motion to adopt the agenda as presented. Mr. Robinson seconded the motion. The motion carried upon a roll-call vote with Mr. Lucero, Mr. Robinson, and Chair Laughter voting in favor. There were no votes against.

Agenda Item 3: Outstanding Alumni Award

VPLSS Solomonson addressed the Board and introduced Elinor Henderson Moore as the Outstanding Alumni Award winner. Elinor recounted her history at Northland Pioneer College, noting it was where she got her start in Higher Education and stated it would always have a special place in her heart and for her family.

Agenda Item 4: Call for Public Comment

None.



Agenda Item 5: Discussion Items

5.A. Standing Presentations:

5.A.1. Financial Position

VPAS Ellison addressed the Board and presented the monthly Financial Position report for the period to January 31st, 2023.

5.A.2. NPC Student Government Association (SGA)

Muriel Metcalf, Academic Advisor at the White Mountain Campus, addressed the Board and provided an update on recent activities to enroll more students to the SGA.

Mr. Leslie joined the meeting at 10:09 a.m.

5.A.3. Faculty Association

Ryan Jones, Co-President of Faculty Association, addressed the Board and offered support for the compensation recommendation which appears on the agenda later in the meeting. Ryan then introduced Professor Inez Schaechterle, Faculty in English, who presented a project her students completed.

5.A.4. Classified & Administrative Staff Organization (CASO)

Jodie Humphrey, CASO President, addressed the Board and also offered support for the compensation recommendation.

Mr. Lucero asked what the CASO position would be if the Gallagher Compensation study showed that CASO members were being overpaid. Ms. Humphrey said that she would not be able to provide an answer till some figures were provided from the study.

Chair Laughter asked what the communication with CASO members had been regarding the compensation request. Ms. Humphrey noted the impact the 7% increase would have for all CASO members but that they realize this is not the long-term solution the college needs.

5.A.5. Northland Pioneer College (NPC) Friends and Family

Betsy Wilson, Director of Friends and Family, addressed the Board and reported on scholarship recipients that had recently received awards before mentioning upcoming events.

Mr. Robinson mentioned how rewarding the review of scholarship applications was and challenged the other members of the Board to participate in the process, as it was a great way to learn about the students at NPC.

5.A.6. Human Resources

Written Report.

President Hazelbaker noted the loss of employee, Curtis Stevens, that was being felt around the college.



5.A.7. Construction Report

David Huish, Director of Construction, addressed the Board and provided a report on the construction projects at the college.

Director Huish also provided a report from Director of Facilities and Vehicles, Justin White, on the ongoing restoration work at the Silver Creek Campus.

5.A.8 Arizona Association of Community College Trustees (AACCT)

Chair Laughter announced a retreat for Board members hosted by the Association of Community College Trustees on April 13th, and the All Trustee meeting in Tempe, AZ on April 19th and 20th.

5.A.9 President's Report

President Hazelbaker addressed the Board and provided a report on topics including: The Request for Proposals for an Enterprise Resource Planning (ERP) software and upcoming vendor demonstrations; Development of a Grants Office; Skills USA competition; Potential changes at the Springerville-Eagar Center; Continuing search for a permanent AVPHR; Plans for Student Advisory meetings; and Legislative activities.

Mr. Leslie asked what Mohave Community College (MCC) had learned so far from their ERP process. President Hazelbaker provided some of the feedback that MCC had provided.

Mr. Leslie asked how the development of a Grants Office fits in to the Strategic Plan and asked if the planning document could be resent to Board Members. President Hazelbaker responded that one of the three priorities identified in the plan was college sustainability with part of this goal to increase the amount of grant funds the college received.

Mr. Leslie asked if the ongoing audit findings in the Information Technology area were being addressed. President Hazelbaker provided information on the actions the college had already taken and what was still to be implemented.

Mr. Robinson asked how long it would take to implement a new ERP. President Hazelbaker responded that it would likely take 24 months.

Mr. Leslie asked if the college would be able to work with Individualized Education Plan (IEP) should Senate Bill 1717 pass as currently proposed. President Hazelbaker noted NPC would not and other colleges around the state reported the same.

5.B. Primary Property Tax Levy & Rate

VPAS Ellison provided a first read of the proposed Property Tax Levy and Rate for 2023-24.

Mr. Lucero asked VPAS Ellison to show the Proposed percentage increase in primary property tax levy. VPAS Ellison showed the amount of 3.66% which would include the new construction within the county.



5.C. 2023-24 Introductory Budget Analysis

VPAS Ellison provided a preliminary look at the 2023-24 budget noting that a state budget was not yet approved so the college was using estimated revenues.

5.D. Procedure 2036 – DGB Travel

Recording Secretary to the Board, Paul Hempsey, addressed the Board and provided revisions to Procedure 2036 for discussion.

Mr. Robinson clarified future steps in the process to revise the procedure.

5.C. Institutional Effectiveness Quarterly Report

Written Report.

Agenda Item 6: Consent Agenda

- A. February 21, 2023 Regular Board Meeting Minutes**
- B. Policies 1215 through 1296**
- C. New Program** – Administration of Justice Peace Officer Certificate of Proficiency (CP), Administration of Justice Certificate of Applied Science (CAS), and Administration of Justice Associate of Applied Science (AAS).

Mr. Robinson made a motion to approve the consent agenda as presented. Mr. Lucero seconded the motion. The motion carried upon a roll-call vote with Mr. Lucero, Mr. Robinson, Mr. Leslie, and Chair Laughter voting in favor. There were no votes against.

Agenda Item 7: For Discussion and Possible Action

7.A. Old Business

None.

7.B. New Business

7.B.1. 2024-2026 Tuition and Fees

VPAS Ellison provided the proposed Tuition and Fees for 2024-2026 noting the changes made from the information provided at the February meeting.

Mr. Robinson made a motion to approve the 2024-2026 Tuition and Fees schedules as presented. Mr. Leslie seconded. The motion carried upon a roll-call vote with Mr. Lucero, Mr. Robinson, Mr. Leslie, and Chair Laughter voting in favor. There were no votes against.

7.B.2. 2023-24 Salary & Wages Recommendation

VPAS Ellison presented the proposed compensation recommendation for 2023-24 noting that staff stood by the recommendation from February of a 7% raise added to the base for all eligible employees.

Mr. Leslie asked for a reminder on the expected compensation study timeline which President Hazelbaker provided. President Hazelbaker also noted that in discussions with CASO and Faculty Association the current thinking on any employee who is considered above the salary range for their position, when the study is finalized, would be to consider them redlined and



unable to receive future increases to compensation until such time that they fall within the position salary band again. President Hazelbaker provided his opinion that he did not see this as being a major issue.

Mr. Lucero asked what happens to grant funded positions when the grant ends. President Hazelbaker responded that the college would look at each position and decide if the position should move to operational money or if the contract would not be renewed, citing specific language included in contracts for grant funded positions.

Mr. Lucero noted that in his opinion the college compensation was on the high end when compared to other jobs within Navajo County and with an across the board pay raise those in the lower paid positions get poorer and those in higher paid positions get richer. President Hazelbaker discussed the option of offering a stipend to employees on the lower end of the pay scale which was requested by Mr. Jouen at the February meeting.

Mr. Lucero noted that he did not anticipate the current climate in the state getting better and with a 7% rise the college was putting itself in a bad position for the future and could therefore not support the proposal. Mr. Lucero suggested that a staggered approach would be better with those earning less than \$45,000 per year getting a 7% rise and those above receiving less.

Chair Laughter noted that she was in favor of the increase, as it costs a lot of money to replace employees and stability helps the college, but would like to investigate performance-based compensation in the future.

Mr. Lucero asked if the college could provide bonuses to staff. President Hazelbaker responded that the college could not.

*Mr. Robinson made a motion to approve an adjustment of 7% to the base for all eligible employees with the stipulation that some employees may find themselves redlined as a result of the compensation study when completed. Mr. Leslie seconded. **The motion carried upon a roll-call vote with Mr. Robinson, Mr. Leslie, and Chair Laughter voting in favor. Mr. Lucero opposed.***

Agenda Item 8: DGB Agenda Items and Informational Needs for Future Meetings

None.

Agenda Item 9: Board Report/Summary of Current Event

Chair Laughter noted the passing of former Navajo Nation President Peterson Zah.

Agenda Item 10: Announcement of Next Regular Meeting

Regular District Governing Board meeting on Tuesday, April 18, 2023 at 10 a.m.



Agenda Item 11: Adjournment

The meeting was adjourned at 12:17 p.m. upon a motion by Mr. Robinson and a second by Mr. Lucero. The motion carried upon a roll-call vote with Mr. Lucero, Mr. Robinson, Mr. Leslie, and Chair Laughter voting in favor. There were no votes against.

Respectfully submitted,



Paul Hempsey
Recording Secretary to the Board

Approved

