

Navajo County Community College District Governing Board Meeting Minutes

February 20, 2024 – 10:00 a.m.

Painted Desert Campus, Tiponi Community Center Board Room
2251 East Navajo Boulevard, Holbrook, AZ 86025

Governing Board Member Present: Ms. Kristine Laughter; Ms. Rosabel Sekayumptewa; Mr. Frank Lucero; Mr. Everett Robinson; Mr. Derrick Leslie.

Governing Board Member Absent:

Others Present: President Chato Hazelbaker; Vice President for Learning and Student Services (VPLSS) Michael Solomonson; Vice President for Administrative Services (VPAS) Maderia Ellison; Associate Vice President – Human Resources (AVPHR) Christine Schaefer; Chief Information Officer (CIO) Michael Jacob; Director of Institutional Effectiveness Judy Yip-Reyes; Farah Bughio, Recording Secretary to the Board; Paul Hempsey; Betsy Wilson; David Huish; Justin White; Allison Landy; Lia Keenan; Josh Rogers; Colleen Marsh; Janalda Nash; Russell Kupfer; Ruth Zimmerman; David Borofsky; Erin Pugh; Scott Flake; Debbie Huish; Terrie Shevat; Donna Soseman; Aaliyah Foster; Ryan Jones; Rich Chanick; Rich Harris; Jonathan Lawrence; Tanya Hayes; Olivia Jaquez; Matt Weber.

Agenda Item 1: Call to Order and Pledge of Allegiance

Chair Robinson called the meeting to order at 10:00 a.m. and led the Pledge of Allegiance.

Agenda Item 2: Adoption of Agenda

Mr. Leslie made a motion to adopt the agenda as presented. Mr. Lucero seconded the motion. The motion carried upon a roll-call vote with Mr. Lucero, Mr. Leslie, Ms. Laughter, Ms. Sekayumptewa and Chair Robinson voting in favor. There were no votes against.

Agenda Item 3: Administrator Emeritus Award – David Huish

AVPHR Christine Schaefer awarded David Huish the Administrative Emeritus award.

Agenda Item 4: Call for Public Comment

None.

Agenda Item 5 Discussion Items

5.A.1. Financial Position

VPAS Ellison addressed the Board and expanded on the financial position of the college for the period July 1, 2023 to December 31, 2023. No questions.



5.A.2. NPC Student Government Association (SGA)

Written report. No questions.

5.A.3. NPC Faculty Association

Ryan Jones, President of the Faculty Association, addressed the Board and expanded on the recommendation from members of the Faculty Association regarding the Gallagher Study and compensation study findings.

Mr. Lucero asked if the Faculty Association recommendation was based on the compensation study. Mr. Jones responded that the Faculty Association recommended a 3% raise for Cost of Living Adjustment (COLA) for all employees.

5.A.4. Classified & Administrative Staff Organization (CASO)

Janalda Nash, CASO President, and Jenna Herman addressed the Board expanding on CASO's recommendation based on the compensation study. CASO recommended a 1.5% raise for COLA.

Ms. Laughter asked for clarification on how wages are affected by certifications and degrees. Ms. Laughter also requested to see the gap in pay grades. President Hazelbaker responded that this request will be part of the Human Resources report for next District Governing Board meeting in March.

Mr. Lucero requested a hard copy of the Gallagher Study. President Hazelbaker stated that a hard copy would be mailed to each Board Member.

Mr. Leslie asked who was addressing concerns raised by employees during the compensation study. President Hazelbaker responded that these concerns will be addressed by the permanent compensation committee and shared governance.

Ms. Sekayumtewa thanked members for clarification on the Gallagher study. Ms. Sekayumtewa also stated she wanted to ensure that top talent is retained.

5.A.5. Northland Pioneer College (NPC) Friends and Family

Betsy Wilson, Director of NPC Friends and Family, addressed the Board and expanded on the review of scholarships and applicants.

Ms. Laughter encouraged Director Wilson to contact a new tutor at the Kayenta Center regarding scholarships.

Mr. Lucero asked about Pedal the Petrified. Director Wilson responded with information about this year's Pedal the Petrified event.

5.A.6. Strategic Planning

Betsy Wilson, Director of NPC Friends and Family and as Chair of Leadership Council, addressed the Board and expanded on Leadership Council's Strategic Planning. No questions.



5.A.7. Human Resources

AVPHR Schaefer addressed the Board and expanded on the report provided in the packet.

Mr. Lucero requested a report distinguishing between staff and faculty turnover rates.

5.A.8 Construction Report

Justin White, Director of Facilities and Vehicles, addressed the Board and provided the report on construction projects at NPC. No questions.

5.A.9 Enterprise Resource Planning (ERP) Implementation Update

Colleen Marsh, Project Manager, addressed the Board and expanded on an update on the implementation of Anthology. No questions.

5.A.10 Arizona Association of Community College Trustees (AACCT)

Board Member Leslie presented a report on his recent trip to Washington D.C. for the ACCT National Legislative Summit.

Mr. Leslie asked about having a Student Board Member. Ms. Laughter stated that she would also like a Student Board Member. Dr. Borofsky, executive director of the Arizona Association of Community College Trustees and AC4, responded with clarification that only one district in Arizona has a Student Board Member but that student representatives from other community colleges do attend the national conferences.

Mr. Lucero asked if a Student Board Member is an elected position. Dr. Borofsky responded that it is a student-elected position.

Mr. Lucero asked VPAS Ellison for clarification on the current tax rate and requested more information for the next District Governing Board Meeting.

5.B. Compensation Recommendation

AVPHR Schaefer addressed the Board and expanded on the Compensation Committee's recommendation. President Hazelbaker addressed the Board and expanded on the President's recommendation.

Mr. Lucero requested a copy of the Impact of Salary Study slide.

Mr. Lucero asked if it was possible to implement different COLA raises based on salaries above and below \$50,000.00. President Hazelbaker stated that this would be a consideration in future years.

Ms. Laughter asked why there are differing recommendations based on the compensation study. President Hazelbaker clarified the difference in strategy between the President and the Compensation Committee in arriving at a recommendation.



Ms. Laughter requested the names and positions of the Compensation Committee members. AVPHR Schaefer listed the names of the Compensation Committee members.

Mr. Leslie asked for clarification on what recommendation the District Governing Board would be voting on. Mr. Leslie also requested clarification on the point of the Compensation Committee if the President is making a different recommendation. President Hazelbaker clarifies the District Governing Board will only be voting on the President's recommendation as this is what the Board has charged him with.

Mr. Leslie asks for clarification on increasing the COLA from 1% to 3% if the budget outlook improved later in the year. President Hazelbaker responded that there could be an additional 2% raise to the already 1% COLA should the budget outlook improve.

Mr. Lucero asked how many employees would be impacted by an increase of base salary to \$20 per hour. President Hazelbaker responded that 63 employees would be affected by this raise in base salary. Mr. Lucero asked if only staff members would be affected by this raise. President Hazelbaker responded that 61 staff members and 2 faculty would be affected by this raise. Mr. Lucero requested clarification on why there are two faculty members that would be affected by the raise. President Hazelbaker responded that the two faculty members have particularities in their discipline and position at the College compared to other faculty with regard to the results of the Gallagher Study (compensation report).

Mr. Leslie requested clarification on whether the \$20-per-hour base raise alone would affect 63 employees or if compression was also a factor. President Hazelbaker stated that compression was also a factor.

5.C. Office of Institutional Effectiveness Report Written Report.

Mr. Leslie asked about the strategic direction being updated for the Higher Learning Commission (HLC). Director Yip-Reyes responded that there will be an update this year.

Mr. Leslie asked if the HLC is still DEI oriented. Director Yip-Reyes responded that the HLC has not changed the way they address DEI.

Mr. Leslie requested the dates of the HLC site visit. Director Yip-Reyes responded that the HLC will be visiting Northland Pioneer College April 8 and 9.

5.D. Financial Aid Practices and Student Completion

Marletha Baloo, Director of Financial Aid, addressed the Board and expanded on the Financial Aid report.

Mr. Leslie asked if the Financial Aid Office had experienced any delays due to the roll-out of the FASFA simplification. Director Baloo replied that there have been issues and there will be a delay in when the office can see student's applications.



Mr. Leslie asked how many students are selected for verification. Director Baloo responded that 6-15% of students are selected for verification. Director Baloo also noted that this year the percentage will drop due to the delays.

Mr. Leslie asked if there is a dedicated person for financial analysis. Director Baloo responded that yes, there was a dedicated financial analyst.

Ms. Laughter thanked Director Baloo.

Ms. Sekayumptewa asked if students are able to correct any errors on their first FASFA application. Director Baloo responded that currently students are encouraged to start a new application when errors occur.

Ms. Sekayumptewa asked if Native students could apply for aid through their Tribal organization if they are denied financial aid through FAFSA. Director Baloo responded that Native students are usually not given aid through their Tribe if they have been denied financial aid through FAFSA. Ms. Sekayumptewa asked if there was anything students can do in this situation. Director Baloo responded that NPC Friends and Family is an option for these students. Director Baloo further stated that Tribal Entities will also aid in remaining unmet needs and that most students are not completely denied aid for reasons other than application issues.

Ms. Sekayumptewa asked if the early college advisors are at high schools. Director Baloo responded that early college advisors are located at the NPC campuses.

Ms. Sekayumptewa asked if anyone reaches out with financial aid information to Ganado High School in Apache county. Director Baloo responded that this high school is not currently being assisted with financial aid information but that they can be included in the next round of outreach.

5.E. 2024-2026 Tuition and Fees

VPAS Ellison addressed the Board and expanded on the tuition and fees projection.

Mr. Lucero asked about a question mark in proposed fees for STEM Instruction in the Early Childhood Classroom. VPAS Ellison clarified that the symbol was a dollar sign and not a question mark, which indicated zero fees.

Mr. Leslie asked who was the vendor for official transcripts. VPAS Ellison responded that The National Student Clearinghouse is the official transcript vendor.

Mr. Leslie asked if it was possible to lower the official transcript fee to near zero. VPAS Ellison responded that request could be taken under advisement but the college passes the fee from the vendor on to the student. Chair Robinson stated that students could also obtain an unofficial transcript at no cost.



Agenda Item 6: President's Summary of Current Events

President Hazelbaker addressed the Board and expanded upon the President's Summary of Current Events.

Agenda Item 7: Consent Agenda

- A. **January 16, 2024 Board Meeting Minutes** (Paul Hempsey)
- B. **Program Modification** - Associate of Arts, Early Childhood (AAEC). (Michael Broyles)
- C. **Program Modification** - Early Childhood Studies Certificate. (Michael Broyles)

*Mr. Leslie made a motion to approve the consent agenda as presented. Mr. Lucero seconded the motion. **The motion carried upon a roll-call vote with Mr. Lucero, Mr. Leslie, Ms. Laughter, Ms. Sekayumptewa and Chair Robinson voting in favor. There were no votes against.***

Agenda Item 8: For Discussion and Possible Action

8.A. Old Business

None.

8.B. New Business

8.B.1. Request to Reduce Summer Tuition

VPAS Ellison addressed the Board and expanded on the request to reduce summer tuition to zero dollars.

Mr. Lucero sought clarification on a number of subjects such as; the number of years the reduction would be in place; the number of credits a student could have waived; current enrollment numbers and projected increases; potential revenue loss and future gains; faculty pay and course offerings for the summer. Multiple staff provided answers with relevant data when available.

*Mr. Lucero made a motion to reduce the tuition for one year only, and limit the number of credits a student could take. **The motion failed due to lack of a second.***

Board members discussed the potential for retention of students from the summer to fall semester, when and how the college might see the offset in revenue loss, the overall impact to the college, and the need for future reports and potential amendments to the tuition rate. President Hazelbaker committed to providing a report when information became available.

*Ms. Laughter made a motion to approve summer tuition reduction to zero dollars for three summers. Ms. Sekayumptewa seconded the motion. **The motion carried upon a roll-call vote with Mr. Leslie, Ms. Laughter, Ms. Sekayumptewa and Chair Robinson voting in favor. Mr. Lucero votes against.***

8.B.2. Request to Lease Copy Machine

Russell Kupfer, Director of Financial Services, addressed the Board and expanded on the request to lease a copy machine.



Mr. Lucero asked if it was a fancy copy machine.

Chair Robinson asked which machine this was to replace.

Mr. Lucero made a motion to approve the lease of a copy machine. Mr. Leslie seconded the motion. The motion carried upon a roll-call vote with Mr. Lucero, Mr. Leslie, Ms. Laughter, Ms. Sekayumptewa and Chair Robinson voting in favor. There were no votes against.

8.B.3. Request to Accept the Financial Audit for Fiscal Year Ended June 30, 2023

Russell Kupfer, Director of Financial Services, addressed the Board and expanded on the request to approve the acceptance of the Financial Audit for Fiscal Year Ended June 30, 2023.

Chair Robinson called for a motion.

Mr. Leslie made a motion to approve the acceptance of the Financial Audit for Fiscal Year Ended June 2023. Mr. Lucero seconded the motion. The motion carried upon a roll-call vote with Mr. Lucero, Mr. Leslie, Ms. Laughter, Ms. Sekayumptewa and Chair Robinson voting in favor. There were no votes against.

Agenda Item 9: DGB Agenda Items and Informational Needs for Future Meetings

Mr. Leslie would like to know the process for an agenda item coming from a cabinet member v. shared governance.

Agenda Item 10: Board Report/Summary of Current and Upcoming Events

Chair Robinson announced the community items in the next month.

Agenda Item 11: Announcement of Next Regular Meeting

March 19

Agenda Item 12: Adjournment

The meeting was adjourned at 1:19 p.m. upon a motion by Chair Robinson and a second by Mr. Lucero. The motion carried upon a roll-call vote with Ms. Laughter, Ms. Sekayumptewa, Mr. Lucero, Mr. Leslie and Chair Robinson voting in favor. There were no votes against.

Respectfully submitted,



Farah Bughio
Recording Secretary to the Board

