Navajo County Community College District **Governing Board Meeting Minutes**

February 21, 2012 - 10:00 a.m. 2251 East Navajo Boulevard, Holbrook, Arizona, 86025

Governing Board Member Present: Bill Jeffers, Ginny Handorf and via telephone Louella Nahsonhoya.

Staff Present: President, Jeanne Swarthout; Vice President, Blaine Hatch; Vice President, Mark Vest; Information Services Director, Eric Bishop; Director of Institutional Research, Leslie Wasson; Recording Secretary to the Board, Kristin Thomas.

Others Present: Everett Robinson, Ann Hess, Stuart Bishop, Maderia Ellison, Eric Henderson, Dan Wattron, Beaulah Bob-Pennypacker, Peggy Belknap, Jake Hinton-Rivera, Brian Burson, Ina Sommers, Greta Whealy, Janet Fish, Terrie Shevat, Tabitha Stickel, Kenny Keith, Randy Rice, Kaitlyn "Laney" Rhinehart, Teri Walker, Dave Roberts, Beverley Kay, Ryan Montgomery, Loyelin Aceves, Rickey Jackson, Susan Olsen, Josh Heath, Theresa Artz-Howard, Rick Fernau, Ariel Roes, R. Alan Roes, Dannette Weiss, Jan Van Dierendonck, Michael Overstreet, Rich Harris, Amy Henderson, Lisa Jayne, Elinor Henderson, Celine Giehl, Alex Brown, Ryan Rademacher, Mike Solomonson, Debra Fisher, Lisa Wheely, Terry McConville, Matt Weber, Eli Blake, Barbara Hockabout, Tracy Mancuso.

Agenda Item 1: Call to Order and Pledge of Allegiance

Chairman Jeffers called the meeting to order at 10:36am and Ms. Handorf led the Pledge of Allegiance.

Agenda Item 2: Adoption of Agenda

Ms. Handorf moved to adopt the agenda as presented. Ms. Nahsonhoya seconded the motion. The vote was unanimous in the affirmative.

Agenda Item 3: Call for Public Comment

- Alex Brown said art is not meant to make us comfortable and expressed respect for all matters of criticism but supports the NPC theatre program under the director Dr. Mike Solomonson.
- Lisa Jayne recognized and thanked Dr. Solomonson for the high caliber of the NPC theatre arts programs, which allowed her to stay here and achieve my undergraduate in theatre arts while working as an intern and to present her thesis to complete her Masters Degree. She said she is a success story of NPC and she is grateful.
- Lisa Whealy said as an audience member she feels it is her responsibility to do research on performances she plans to attend; therefore, she is able to make an informed decision based her personal choice. She said the root of this problem today is placing too much responsibility on the institution as opposed to taking personal responsibility of choice.
- Michael Overstreet said he was attending to support the arts program. He said we each have our own brand of morality and censorsing morality by community violates his rights to individual morality. He said NPC has a well-established theater program and Grease is the longest running play in production history.
- Danette Weiss thanked the executive staff for the level of professionalism during the investigation. She said she and her husband attended *The Underpants* at NPC on Valentines Day; read the warning labels for adult content on NPC website; and, was shocked sometimes. She said they still had a great time and laughed. She said, "Do not decide what is appropriate or inappropriate for me to see, leave me to choose. That is why I live in America. I do not agree with some forms of art, but that is my opinion. I am in full support of the NPC theatre program. I plan on taking my son to see Alladin this summer. I would never take him to see The Underpants that is my choice."

Navajo Community College District Governing Board Meeting - 2/21/12 - Page 1 of 6



• Beverly Kay, said this meeting has been very educational for me. She said the "Community Values Committee is not in favor of censorship. She said, "We are in favor of informing the community of what is happening. Our committee had the Playboy magazines removed from the front shelves of local stores. Democracy means we can disagree without being disagreeable. Our communication was lacking in the sense of censorship and ending the NPC theater program, we did not want those things. We have accomplished we wanted; we wanted the audience to be made aware of the content so audience members would not be uncomfortable in the performances. We wanted more family orientated performances, I'm glad you are doing that. We want theatrical and musical to be separate. We do not want sexual content in the theatre so I can sit there with my father and grandchildren and be comfortable. I like my mind to be open. I do not want to see sexual gestures I prefer to use my imagination. I do not want to see something on stage that I do not want to see my teenage granddaughter doing."

Agenda Item 4: Reports

4.A. - Financial Position - Vice President Hatch

Mr. Hatch presented the first six months of fiscal budget period with 50% expired. Mr. Hatch reports the primary property tax levy for December is on target at 59%. Mr. Hatch noted out-of-county reimbursement primary payment was received at \$550,469. Tuition and fees stand at 51% as expected. Revenues are 61% and expenditures are 45% in general fund. Looking at the unrestricted plant fund Mr. Hatch noted a transfer should have been made for revenues to bring to 50% from the general fund to the capital fund. Capital expenditures are 38%. Mr. Hatch reports all items on the lower portion of the report are on target. Mr. Hatch stated net cash, year-to-date, for all activities is \$3,653,304.

4.B. – NPC CASO – Ina Sommers No report.

4.C. - NPC Faculty Association - Brian Burson

Brian Burson, faculty association president presented a position statement on Academic Freedom: "Based on the reactions of a few minority community members from the NPC theater department production of Grease have raised some very significant Academic Freedom questions. Some members of the community have suggested that entities outside of the college should have power to oversee and censor the content of NPC plays and by extension the content of college courses; NPC plays are produced as part of an NPC course. This clearly represents a monumental change to official Academic Freedom Policy. The undersigned faculty members request the board to reconfirm the Academic Freedom Policy. A reversal of the policy could have a significantly negative impact on the college. In 2007 the NPC District Governing Board adopted an official stance in regard to Academic Freedom and Policy 1810, which is attached. Any changes in procedure to the content of NPC plays would change the policy significantly. In addition to the obvious First Amendments issue Academic Freedom is long established American concept. While protection from institutional actions based on content that someone dislikes is essential transferring power to any group outside the institution would be disastrous. We believe that the board should consider granting oversight power to an Ad-Hoc community group of any college decision would set a significant change in college procedure and set an extremely dangerous precedent. Such decisions have traditionally been the role of the District Governing Board and of academic departments and faculty members. Does the board want to open the door to community approval of course content? Should the content of Literature, Psychology, History, Art, Anthropology courses etc. have to meet the approval of self appointed community citizens? This change in policy could have profoundly negative consequences. NPC would find it extremely difficult to hire and retain high quality faculty in an environment where the institution has endorsed such an attack on academic freedom. Such a position might also leave the college vulnerable to significant legal actions both from parties seeking to further erode academic freedom and from those seeking to defend it. While the particular theatre production in question is only a secondary issue it is worth noting that Grease enjoyed the best community support, based on ticket sales, of any play in recent years. We recommend that the board reaffirm established standards of Academic Freedom rather than embark on a significant and dubious change in policy based a small minority. Sincerely, The Faculty Senate."

Navajo Community College District Governing Board Meeting – 2/21/12 – Page 2 of 6

Northland Pioneer College

Post Office Box 610 • Holbrook, AZ 86025 • (928) 524-7311 • Fax (928) 524-7312 • www.npc.edu

4.D. – NPC Student Government Association- Melissa Luatua No report.

4.E. – **NPC Foundation-** Lance Chugg No report.

Agenda Item 5: Consent Agenda

Ms. Handorf moved to approve the Consent Agenda, as presented. Ms. Nahsonhoya seconded the motion. *The vote was unanimous in the affirmative.*

Consent Agenda (Action):

A. January 17, 2012 Regular Meeting Minutes (T2)

Agenda Item 6: Old Business None.

Agenda Item 7: New Business

7.A. –Request to Approve Reaffirmation of Policy 1810 and Policy 1102 (Action) – President Swarthout President Swarhout stated Policy 1810, Academic Freedom and Policy 1102, Equal Opportunity and Educational Opportunities. Dr. Swarthout explained the relationship between accreditation and academic freedom with legal and ethical requirements by federal and state statutes.

Ms. Nahsonhoya moved to approve the recommendation as presented. Ms. Handorf seconded the motion. Ms. Handorf commented the existing policy has been approved by federal and state regulations and said she absolutely agreed to reaffirm. Ms. Handorf added she has learned a tremendous amount from the NPC theatre department because of the great depth of course content. Ms. Handorf stated she has observed that Dr. Solomonson allows his students to evolve as performers; he does not force them to do anything. Mr. Jeffers summarized by saying because of the seriousness of the accusations made, the staff and the board and all those involved took this very seriously. Mr. Jeffers stated he was happy there were no findings. He said this issue has been very seriously addressed. Mr. Jeffers stated the intent was not to put a damper on individual freedoms. Mr. Jeffers stated the sincerity and appreciation of all involved is highly valued. Dr. Swarthout added that this process has been very painful for many and sincerely hopes it will not happen in the future. *The vote was unanimous in the affirmative*.

7.B. - Request Approval to Purchase Passenger Vans (Action) - Vice President Hatch

Mr. Hatch stated two 2012 Ford E-350 15 passenger vans from state contractor Chapman Ford for \$57, 398.32 to replace existing vehicles based on mileage, age and increasing cost of maintenance. Mr. Jeffers asked if local vendors had been contacted and could not meet the state of Arizona pricing. Mr. Hatch confirmed. Ms. Nahsonhoya moved to approve the recommendation as presented. Ms. Handorf seconded the motion. Ms. Nahsonhoya asked to confirm the total price is \$57, 398.32. Mr. Jeffers confirmed. The vote was unanimous in the affirmative.

7.C. - Request Approval to Purchase Security Camera System (Action)- Vice President Hatch

Mr. Hatch reports campus security has recently been improved with presence of uniformed security presence at each campus. Mr. Hatch stated the request to install security cameras at all four campuses and Hopi Center and Whiteriver Center. Mr. Hatch stated Apache County centers have determined no interest to participate in this purchase. Security cameras will serve primarily as a deterrent. Mr. Hatch stated the video system has a digital recording feature; for easy storage, recall and viewing. Chubb Fire and Security has been awarded the Mohave Educational Services cooperative contract; the college is a member of this purchasing group. Mr. Hatch reports the purchasing amount will not exceed \$200, 637.70 plus tax. Mr. Hatch reports the need for video surveillance systems was not identified in the capital budget process; however, adjustments have been made and funds are available for the purchase. Ms. Handorf asked if staff will be hired to monitor cameras. Mr. Hatch responded that our plan is not to hire anybody to monitor. Ms. Handorf asked if the warranty is renewable. Mr. Hatch stated the warranty issues should be identified in the first



three years and service options will be researched further. Ms. Handorf moved to approve the request as presented. Ms. Nahsonhoya seconded the motion. Ms. Handorf asked where the college will be impacted from funds adjustment. Mr. Hatch stated the funds were in savings and would not impact other planned projects. *The vote was unanimous in the affirmative.*

7.D. -Deferred Maintenance Re-roofing Project

i. Request Approval of Architect Contract Amendment (Action)- Vice President Hatch

See discussion 7.D. ii.

Ms. Handorf moved to approve the request as presented. Ms. Nahsonhoya seconded the motion. Ms. Handorf commented delight in the NPC budget preparation process to avoid requesting bonds from the community. *The vote was unanimous in the affirmative.*

ii. Request Approval to Purchase HVAC Equipment (Action)- Vice President Hatch

Mr. Hatch reports deferred maintenance is in our capital budget plan. Mr. Hatch referenced a professional roof survey and subsequent inspections reflect the Learning Centers in Show Low, Snowflake and Winslow, along with the Ponderosa Center in Show Low are at the end of useful life. Mr. Hatch stated the heating, ventilation and cooling systems at each referenced location are also at the end of the useful life. Mr. Hatch noted the current system is a chiller and should be replaced with a gas pack system. There is a 12-week lead time required for the upgraded HVAC equipment delivery. Mr. Hatch added in an effort to minimize the impact to students, the project be completed as soon as possible. Mr. Hatch referenced the cost-benefit analysis if the re-roofing and HVAC replacement simultaneously. Mr. Hatch requested an amendment to the current contract with the DLR Group to provide services and design. Mr. Hatch stated the overall estimated cost of the project is \$2.4 million which is included in the three year capital plan deferred maintenance project budget line. Mr. Hatch reports, of the three bidders Mechanical Products Southwest is the lowest and the preferred brand of HVAC equipment at \$480,666. Mr. Hatch stated this bid is lower than initially estimated by the architects, which will present cost savings to the overall project. Ms. Handorf moved to approve the request as presented. Ms. Nahsonhoya seconded the motion. *The vote was unanimous in the affirmative.*

7.E. -Tuition and Fees (First Read)- Vice President Hatch

Mr. Hatch reports discussion based on the board approved budget development guidelines which includes the following assumptions for tuition and fees: A.) increases incrementally; B.) competitive in our market by maintaining a comparative position to other Arizona community colleges; and C.) gives consideration to the impact on students. Mr. Hatch noted approximately \$50,000 of additional revenue will be generated for each one dollar increase in tuition. Mr. Hatch stated he met with Student Government representatives, who understood the need for small regular increases in tuition and preferred a tuition increase of \$2 rather than \$3 or \$4. Mr. Hatch stated to comply with a ruling by Arizona Attorney General Tom Horne, the recommendation is to eliminate the tiered tuition rate for out-of-state students. Mr. Hatch presented historical tuition information. Mr. Hatch presented a comparison with other Arizona community colleges from several perspectives Mr. Hatch stated NPC would stay in relatively the same place based on each scenario. Mr. Hatch reports adjustments to course fees are based on actual costs for supplies and maintenance. Northland Pioneer College course bank includes over 1,200 courses, with less than 1/3 requiring a course fee. Mr. Hatch stated that based on board feedback a firm recommendation will be presented for adoption of the 2012-2013 tuition and fees schedule at the March district governing board meeting. Mr. Hatch stated preference to lean towards a low-end increase at \$2.

Agenda Item 8: Standing Business

8.A. - Strategic Planning and Accreditation Steering Committee (SPASC) Report - Director Bishop

Mr. Bishop reports current SPASC focus is completion and retention. Defining and measuring completion for community colleges remains at the forefront. Mr. Bishop stated a SPASC retreat is scheduled this Friday with Pillar Teams to analyze ways to incorporate convocation data into the strategic plan. Mr. Bishop stated sequencing changes to occur in the fall to revise strategic plan prior to entering the budgeting process in the spring. This change remains

Navajo Community College District Governing Board Meeting – 2/21/12 – Page 4 of 6

Northland Pioneer College

Post Office Box 610 • Holbrook, AZ 86025 • (928) 524-7311 • Fax (928) 524-7312 • www.npc.edu

consistent with the idea that the strategic plan drives the budget. Currently, accomplishments will be recorded and strategic plan revisions will be presented to the Board as a first read in May 2012 and approved in June 2012.

8.B. - Human Resources Update - Dan Wattron

Mr. Wattron reports one position was filled and there are seven positions open. January Employee of the month: Dr. Wei Ma, Faculty in Instructional Technology.

Agenda Item 9: President's Report - President Swarthout

9.A. - Regional Science Fair

Mr. Vest stated he was contacted by Cal Manis, Technology Specialist in Superintendents Office, to announce organization of science fair and invited NPC to participate. Mr. Vest is attending meetings and NPC will provide gifts, facility and equipment. Navajo County and Apache County participants will include students in 4th grade through high school. Dr. Swarthout noted kids college course work that NPC staff, Loyelin Aceves, is developing to encourage kids to participate in college environment at a young age.

9.B. - Master Facility Plan Update

Mr. Hatch reports 12 Master Facility Planning meetings have occurred at multiple NPC locations to receive feedback from faculty, staff community members. A survey has been disbursed and collected to measure specific needs related the Master Facility Plan and DLR Group.

9.C. - Sabbatical

Dr. Swarthout reports based on the recommendation of respective Deans and Vice President Vest two sabbaticals have been discussed. Faculty member Shannon Newman has requested a Fall 2012 sabbatical to redevelop and create a hybrid of math curriculum for developmental services. English faculty member Jennifer Witt has requested a Spring 2013 sabbatical to begin trial pursuit of her Ph. D, to develop NPC children's literature ideas and improve NPC writing center. Dr. Swarthout confirmed both sabbatical proposals to be very strong.

9.D. - Friends of the Petrified Forest National Park Update

Dr. Swarthout reports she will attend a tour of the Petrified Forest National Park on March 10. The Museum of NAU is a new member of the partnership to create services to benefit all parties of interest including students and visitors. These conversations are moving forward very positively and very quickly. Dr. Swarthout reports she and Dr. Henderson are exploring the possibility of starting a high school field school with the park.

Agenda Item 10: Board Report/Summary of Current Events

Ms. Handorf reports the White Mountain Belles, Men's High Country Chorus and Barbershop Quartet are performing on March 10 at the Performing Arts Center. A fundraising effort is planned to proceed this performance on Friday March 9 at Blue Ridge Auditorium with the same group of performers.

Mr. Jeffers announced the February 29 Holbrook Development Community Forum on an informative session of Potash development.

Agenda Item 11: Announcement of Next Regular Meeting: Tuesday, March 19, 2012. (Tuesday, March 20, 2012)

Agenda Item 12: Adjournment



The meeting was adjourned upon a motion by Ms. Nahsonhoya, a second by Ms. Handorf and with a unanimous affirmative vote.

Respectfully submitted,

Kristin Thomas

Recording Secretary to the Board

Chairman

Ginny Handorf

Board Secretary



Post Office Box 610 • Holbrook, AZ 86025 • (928) 524-7311 • Fax (928) 524-7312 • www.npc.edu