Navajo County Community College District Special Board Meeting Minutes

 $May\ 20,\ 2014-10:00\ a.m.$ Painted Desert Campus, Tiponi Community Center 2251 East Navajo Boulevard, Holbrook, Arizona

Governing Board Member Present: Ms. Ginny Handorf, Mr. Daniel Peaches, Mr. James Matteson, Mr. Prescott Winslow, Mr. Frank Lucero

Staff Present: President Jeanne Swarthout; Vice President Blaine Hatch; Vice President Mark Vest; Information Services Director Eric Bishop; Institutional Effectiveness Director Dr. Leslie Wasson; Recording Secretary to the Board Lisa Jayne.

Others Present: Ann Hess, Everett Robinson, Autom Christensen, Jake Hinton, Tom Nagle, Peggy Belknap, Stuart Bishop, Kenny Keith, Margaret White, Maderia Ellison, Sharon Hokanson, Kathleen Ritz, Jenny Shumway, Rickey Jackson, Brad Farber, Beaulah Bob-Pennypacker, Jeremy Raisor, Curtis Casey.

Agenda Item 1: Call to Order

Chair Handorf called the meeting to order at 10:46 a.m.

Agenda Item 2: Request to Approve 2014-2015 Proposed Tax Levy – Vice President Hatch Vice President Hatch stated staff recommends that the proposed 2014-2015 tax levy be approved.

Mr. Lucero stated his concern is that the College is spending money on property that the College doesn't own and doesn't control. According to his own calculations the College is spending a minimum of \$800,000, possibly more, and all the College gains is \$641,000. If the College is asking the public for more money, the College should need it. Although he is a proponent of higher education, he is not a proponent of spending money just to spend money or because it's politically advisable.

Chair Handorf asked Vice President Hatch if he wanted to direct Mr. Lucero's comments. Vice President Hatch stated he wasn't clear what Mr. Lucero was referring to when referencing the amounts of \$641,000 or \$800,000.

Mr. Lucero stated it was money spent on property the College doesn't own. Mr. Winslow asked if Mr. Lucero was referring to NATC. Mr. Lucero stated he was. Mr. Winslow stated that Mr. Lucero should make that clear. Chair Handorf stated that the College doesn't own all property that it uses to do business. Mr. Lucero stated that if the College is going to expend money it should recoup it.



Mr. Winslow spoke in support of the levy increase and gave several reasons for this. He also stated that the College is the best managed institution he's ever served on a board for as the College maintains a cash reserve that can sustain the college functions for a full six months, and that it also maintains a contingency fund of \$1.3 million in case of emergency. It has also adopted a capital project reserve fund in order to save up for big projects, rather than ask for a secondary tax rate.

Chair Handorf stated that the Board has to ask if decisions are going to serve the long-term interest of the entire college, not just a specific area. She spoke in favor of the college's model of providing services in different areas of the County stating that it's an excellent long-term value for the residents of Navajo County and communities in Apache County.

Mr. Matteson spoke in favor of the levy increase stating that raising tuition to cover the increases would punish the students, and keep many from being able to complete a degree.

Mr. Lucero asked if there was a tax increase last year. Vice President Hatch stated under Truth in Taxation Rate there was none. Mr. Lucero asked again if there was a tax increase. President Swarthout stated that the increase from last year was based on new growth, and there was no tax increase.

Brad Farber thanked the Board and the College for its civility.

Mr. Matteson moved to approve the proposed tax levy rate and forward to the Board of Supervisors. The motion was seconded by Mr. Winslow. The vote passed upon a roll-call vote, with affirmative votes from Mr. Winslow, Mr. Matteson, Mr. Peaches, and Chair Handorf; Mr. Lucero dissented.

Agenda Item 3: Request to Approve 2014-2015 Proposed Budget – Vice President Hatch Vice President Hatch stated that the preliminary budget as approved and discussed in the public hearing has been published and noticed.

Mr. Matteson moved to adopt the proposed 2014-2015 budget as presented. Mr. Winslow seconded the motion. The vote passed upon a roll-call vote, with affirmative votes from Mr. Winslow, Mr. Matteson, Mr. Peaches, and Chair Handorf; Mr. Lucero dissented.

Agenda Item 4: Request to Adopt 2014-2017 Proposed Capital Budget – Vice President Hatch

Vice President Hatch stated staff is recommending approval of a proposed 3-year-capital budget, incorporating the upcoming year, plus two additional years.

Mr. Winslow stated that although the three-quarters of a million slated for maintenance could be put off, it would be shifting the cost to future generations and this would be unwise and unfair.



Mr. Matteson moved adoption of the 2014-2017 proposed capital budget as presented. Mr. Lucero seconded. The vote passed upon a roll-call vote, with affirmative votes from Chair Handorf, Mr. Winslow, Mr. Matteson, Mr. Peaches, and Mr. Lucero.

Agenda Item 5: Adjournment

The meeting was adjourned at 11:25a.m. upon a motion by Mr. Matteson, a second by Mr. Lucero-, and a unanimous affirmative vote.

Respectfully submitted,

Lisa Jayne

Recording Secretary to the Board

Navajo Community College District Governing Board Special Meeting - 5/20/14 - Page 3 of 3

